13th August, 2019

Minutes of the Delhi Medical Council meeting held on 02^{nd} August, 2019 at 2.30 pm in Conference Room, Delhi Medical Council, New Delhi, is placed opposite for your kind perusal.

(Dr. Girish Tyagi) Secretary, DMC

President, DMC

DMC/Council Meeting/F.2/1/2019/

2nd August, 2019

Minutes of the Council meeting of the Delhi Medical Council held on 2nd August, 2019 in

Conference Room of the Delhi Medical Council.

A meeting of the Delhi Medical Council was convened on 2nd August for 2.30 pm in Conference Room of the Delhi Medical Council.

The meeting was adjourned at 2.30 pm due to lack of quorum. The meeting was reconvened at 3.00 pm. The following were present:-

1.	Dr. Arun Kumat Gupta	President
2.	Dr. Narinder Pal Singh	Vice-President
3.	Dr. Ajay Gambhir	Member
4.	Dr. Anil Agarwal	Member
5.	Dr. Anil Kumar Mittal	Member
6.	Dr. Anil Goval	Mombon

Dr. Anil Goyal Member 7. Dr. Atul Kumar Gupta Member

Dr. Chander Parkash Member Dr. Deepak K. Tempe Member

10. Dr. Harish Gupta Member 11. Dr. Narendra Kumar Saini Member

12. Dr. Rani Kumar Member 13. Dr. Prof. Vadana Roy Member

14. Dr. Vinay Aggarwal Member

The following member could not attend the meeting:-

		0
1.	Dr. B.L. Sherwal	Member
2.	Dr. Jitendra Pal Singh Sawhney	Member
3.	Dr. Kamal Kishore Parwal	Member
4.	Maj. General N.C. Arora	Member
5.	Dr. Nomeeta Gupta	Member
6.	Dr. Satendra Singh	Member
7.	Dr. Shridhar Dwivedi	Member
8.	Dr. Subodh Kumar	Member
9.	Dr. Ashok Kumar	Member

The following agenda was discussed:-

Member

1. Minutes of the meeting held on 28th June, 2019.

The minutes of the Council meeting held on 28th June, 2019 were circulated to all the members present, for information.

2. Action taken report of minutes of the meeting held on 28th June, 2019.

Action taken reports, which were circulated to all the members present, were approved. The same are appended herewith as annexure 'A' (colly).

3. To discuss cases of medical negligence and unethical conduct.

- (a) The Order of the Executive Committee in complaint No.2578 Smt. Shuchita Gupta, r/o- SCF 25, New Grain Market, Salam Tabri, Ludhiana, alleging medical negligence on the part of Dr. Subhash Gupta and Max Super Specialty Hospital, Saket, New Delhi and Dr. Ashok Chaudhary of Institute of Liver and Biliary Sciences, in the treatment administered to complainant's husband Shri Vikas Gupta, resulting in his death on 01.06.2018 at Max Super Specialty Hospital, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.
- (b) The Order of the Executive Committee in complaint No.2688 a representation from Police Station, Jaffarpur Kalan, New Delhi-110073, seeking medical opinion regarding alleged medical negligence in the treatment administered to Smt. Sharda Devi at Chaudhary Brahm Prakash Ayurvedic Charak Sansthan, Khera Dabar, New Delhi, Khera Dabar, Najafgarh, New Delhi-110073, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.
- (c) The Order of the Executive Committee in complaint No.2276- a representation from police station, Rohini, Delhi, seeking medical opinion on a complaint of Shri Naresh Rathore, r/o- B-491, Sector-01, Rohini, Delhi-110085, alleging medical negligence in the treatment administered to complaint's son Shri. Vicky Rathore at Jaipur Golden Hospital, 2-Institutional Area, Sector-III, Rohini, New Delhi-110085 and Institute of Liver and Biliary Sciences, D-1, Vasant Kunj, New Delhi, resulting in his death on 06.06.2015, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.
- (d) The Order of the Executive Committee in complaint No.2782 a complaint of Shri Vivek Chaudhary s/o Shri Mahaveer Chaudhary r/o Narnol, Jila Mahendragarh

(Haryana) alleging medical negligence on the part of Dr. Amar Sareen of Shri Balaji Action Hospital, A-4, Paschim Vihar, New Delhi-110063 in the treatment of complainant, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.

- (e) The Order of the Executive Committee in complaint No.2744 a complaint of Shri. Jagmohan Kumar, s/o Shri Charanjit Kumar, r/o- 23/32, East Punjabi Bagh, Delhi, alleging medical negligence on the part of Dr. Shalabh Aggarwal, Dr. Atul N.C Peters, Indraprastha Apollo Hospital, Sarita Vihar, Mathura Road, New Delhi-110076, in the treatment administered to Smt. Veena Kumar, resulting in her death on 21.11.2018 at Sir Ganga Ram Hospital, where she was subsequently received treatment, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.
- (f) The Order of the Executive Committee in complaint No. 2609 a complaint of Shri S.K. Sharma, K-1110, Gaur Green City, 8, Vaibhav Khand, Indirapuram, Ghaziabad-201014 (referred hereinafter as the complainant), alleging medical negligence on the part of doctors of Fortis Escorts Heart Institute Okhla Road, New Delhi, in the treatment of complainant, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.
- (g) The Order of the Executive Committee in complaint No.2758 a complaint of Smt. Shaista Khan, r/o- S-6, Pratap Nagar, Jangpura, New Delhi, alleging medical negligence on the part of doctors of Holy Family Hospital, Okhla Road, New Delhi, in the treatment administered to complainant's husband Shri. Gulzar Ahmed Khan, resulting his death on 12.08.2018 was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.
- (h) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No. 2552 a representation from Police Station Shalimar Bagh, seeking medical opinion on a complaint of Smt. Sapna Jain r/o C-706, Kenwood Towers, Charmwood Village, Suraj Kund Faridabad-121009, alleging medical negligence in the treatment of her baby at Fortis Hospital, Shalimar Bagh, New Delhi, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.

Dr. Arun Gupta recused himself from the proceedings.

(i) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No.1996 a representation from Police Station Sarita Vihar, Delhi, seeking medical opinion on a complaint of Shri Abdul Khalil Latifi, alleging medical negligence in the treatment administered to his son master Abdul Wahab Latifi in Indraprastha Apollo Hospital, Sarita Vihar, Delhi-Mathura Road, New Delhi-110076, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council (j) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No. 2490 a complaint of Dr. Alok Kumar, Flat No. 211, Secotr-A-5, Pocket-6, DDA Flats, Narela, Delhi-110040, alleging medical negligence on the part of doctors of Nulife Hospital, 1616 Outram Lines, GTB Nagar (Hakikat Nagar) Delhi-110009, in the treatment of complainant's wife and new born baby, was taken up for confirmation before the Delhi Medical Council.

Whilst confirming the Order of the Disciplinary Committee, the Council observes that in the facts and circumstances of this case; the punishment of removal of name of Dr. Shakuntala Kumar from the State Medical Register of the Delhi Medical Council for a period of 7 days is highly inadequate; as she has committed serious lapses in the medical management of the patient Smt. Anshu Bala, which not only compromised the health of the patient but also her newborn baby, as has been highlighted in the Disciplinary Committee's observations. The Council, therefore, holds that name of Dr. Shakuntala Kumar (Delhi Medical Council Registration No.2959) be removed from the State Medical Register of the Delhi Medical Council for period of 90 days.

The Council further observed that the Order directing the removal of name from the State Medical Register of Delhi Medical Council shall come into effect after 30 days from the date of the Order.

This observation is to be incorporated in the final Order to be issued. The Order of the Disciplinary Committee stands modified to this extent and the modified Order is confirmed.

- (k) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No.2385-a complaint of Smt. Poonam, r/o- House No. 14/2, Bhogal Lane, Jangpura, S.O. Delhi-110014, alleging medical negligence on the part of doctors of Guru Harkishan Hospital, Gurdwara-Bala Sahib Complex, Ring Road, New Delhi-110014, in the treatment of complainant's husband late Shri Chander Bhan, resulting in his death, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.
- (I) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No. 1788- a complaint of Shri Rajesh Sharma s/o Shri Mahender Singh Sharma r/o- E-7B/577, Sangam Vihar forwarded by the ACP/PG for Dy. Commissioner of Police, West District; New

Delhi, alleging medical negligence on the part of Dr. Aditya Sharda, Dr.Rekha, Dr. Ritu Bhatani of Park Hospital, Meera Enclave (Chowkhandi), Near Keshopur, Outer Ring Road, New Delhi and Dr. Vishwardshi Jaiswal, Dr.V.S. Bhalla, Dr. Priti Shah of Park Hospital, Sohna Road Main, Sector-47, South City-II, Gurgaon(Haryana), in the treatment administered to the complainant's daughter Miss. Rajni, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.

(m) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No. 2111- a representation form Police Station, Chankya Puri, Delhi, seeking medical opinion on a complaint of Smt. Manpreet Kaur d/o late Shri. Ajit Singh r/o- House No. 562, Sector-02, Urban Estatee, Thanesar Kurukshetra, Haryana, alleging medical negligence on the part of Dr. K.K. Mishra of Primus Super Specialty Hospital, Chandragupta Marg, Chanakyapuri, New Delhi-110021, in the treatment of complainant was taken up for confirmation before the Delhi Medical Council.

Whilst confirming the Order of the Disciplinary Committee, the Council observes that in the facts and circumstances of this case, since Dr. K.K. Mishra did not exercise due diligence in timely detecting the post-surgery infection which might have mitigated the complainant's condition, inspite of the complainant being in regular follow-up with him; the interest of justice will be served, if he (Dr. K.K. Mishra (Dr. Kaushal Kant Mishra), Delhi Medical Council Registration No.25022) is suspended for 7 days from the State Medical Register of the Delhi Medical Council; thus, his name be removed from the State Medical Register of the Delhi Medical Council for a period of 7 days.

The Council further observed that the Order directing the removal of name from the State Medical Register of Delhi Medical Council shall come into effect after 30 days from the date of the Order.

This observation is to be incorporated in the final Order to be issued. The Order of the Disciplinary Committee stands modified to this extent and the modified Order is confirmed.

(n) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No. 2586- a representation from Dy. Commissioner of Police, Shahdara District, New Delhi, seeking medical opinion on a complaint of Smt. Gudiaya Koli w/o Shri Jai Prakash Koli, F-1/71, Sunder Nagri, New Delhi-110095, alleging medical negligence on the part of doctors of Jeevan Jyoti Clinic and Hospital, 118-A/1, Dilshad Garden, Delhi-110095, in the treatment administered to complainant's husband Shri. Jai Prakash Koli, resulting in amputation of his leg at St. Stephen, was taken up for confirmation before the Delhi Medical Council.

Whilst confirming the Order of the Disciplinary Committee, the Council after going through the file and exhaustive discussions and deliberations found that some of the statement and observations are superfluous like delay, which is very subjective and depends upon situational analysis of treating team. Hence, it is not appropriate to comment in retrospect. The Council further observed that degree of reasonable care was given by surgical team of doctors to manage this case. In view of the same, the Council observed that the punishment of removal of name of Dr. Samresh Mohan (Delhi Medical Council Registration No.4448) was a bit harsh punishment and the same was not warranted. It was further observed that interests of justice will be served if a warning is issued to Dr. Samresh Mohan (Delhi Medical Council Registration No.4448). The Council, therefore, directed that a warning be issued to Dr. Samresh Mohan (Delhi Medical Council Registration No.4448).

The Council also confirmed the punishment of warning awarded to Dr. Vishwanath Dudani (Delhi Medical Council Registration No.1752) by the Disciplinary Committee.

The Order of the Disciplinary Committee stands modified to this extent and the modified Order is confirmed.

(o) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No. 2002-A complaint of Shri Sher Singh s/o Shri Charan Singh r/o House No.RZ-162, R Block, Near Roshan Pura, Najabgarh, New Delhi-110043, forwarded by the Medical Council of India, alleging medical negligence on the part of doctors of Rockland Hospital, Sector-12, Dwarka, New Delhi, in the treatment administered to the complainant, was confirmed by the Delhi Medical Council.

4. To discuss about the Minutes of the Anti Quackery Committee.

The Secretary informed that there are no minutes of the Anti-Quackery of the Delhi Medical Council on which discussion is required, as no meeting of the Anti-Quackery Committee of the Delhi Medical Council had been convened.

5. To discuss about the Minutes of the Finance Committee.

The minutes of the meeting of the Finance Committee of the Delhi Medical Council held on 15th July, 2019 which were circulated to the members present, were confirmed.

- To discuss the development in space allotment at DMRC IT Park, Shastri Park, Metro Station.
- a) On 3rd July, 2019 letter along with drawings as per transmittal of M/s Sandeep Geeta and Associates Pvt. Ltd. was sent to Delhi Metro Railway Corporation for approval.
- b) On 05th July, 2019 Delhi Metro Railway Corporation informed via Email 25 objections in the drawings submitted on 03rd July, 2019.
- c) On 25th July, 2019, the deficiencies as pointed by Delhi Metro Railway Corporation was fulfilled and the 25 drawings along with project report was submitted to Delhi Metro Railway Corporation for approval.
- d) On 31st July, 2019, letter was sent to Delhi Metro Railway Corporation for approval at the earliest.

7. Any other item with permission of Chair.

(a) The Order of the Disciplinary Committee in complaint No.1672 of Miss. Kiran, r/o- B-329, A.V. Nagar, All India Institute of Medical Sciences Campus, New Delhi-110049, alleging medical negligence on the part of doctors of All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Ansari Nagar, New Delhi-110029, in the treatment administered to the complainant's brother Shri Bharat Agria, resulting in his death on 31st August, 2015, could not be taken up for deliberations before the Delhi Medical Council due to paucity of time; to come up for deliberations in next Council meeting.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

(Dr. Girish Tyagi) Secretary

Action taken report in terms of the minutes of the Council meeting of the Delhi Medical Council held on 28th June, 2019 in Conference Room, Delhi Medical Council

SNo	Medical Council Agenda Item	
		Action taken
1	Minutes of the meeting held on 09th May,2019	Approved.
2	Action taken report of minutes of the meeting held on 09th May, 2019	Approved.
3.	To discuss cases of medical negligence and unethical conduct.	Order in Complaint No. 2753,2607,2584,2668,2735,279 2521,2716,1925,2194,2277,1810,1964,1744, 1672 of the Disciplinar Committee & Executive Committee have been communicated to the concerned parties and Comp.2726 referred to the Disciplinar Committee
4	To discuss about the Minutes of the Anti Quackery Committee.	Closure order passed.
5	To discuss about the Minutes of the Finance Committee	Confirmed
6	To discuss the development in space allotment at DMRC IT Park, Shastri Park, Metro Station	03 rd July, 2019 letter along with drawings as per transmittal of M/s Sandeep Geeta and Associates Pvt. Ltd. was sent to Delhi Metro Railway Corporation for approval and matter is under consideration
5	Any other item with permission of Chair	Consideration

(Dr. Girish Tyagi) Secretary